



Municipalities building a  
stable insurance future.

125 E. Court Street  
Ithaca, NY 14850  
604-274-5590  
INFO: [consortium@twcny.rr.com](mailto:consortium@twcny.rr.com)  
[www.tompkinscountyny.gov/hcconsortium](http://www.tompkinscountyny.gov/hcconsortium)

## MINUTES

Greater Tompkins County Municipal Health Insurance Consortium  
Joint Committee on Plan Structure and Design  
January 8, 2015 – 1:30 p.m.  
Rice Conference Room, Health Department

Approved

### **Present:**

#### ***Municipal Representatives: 8 members***

Laura Shawley, Town of Danby; Joan Mangione, Village of Cayuga Heights; Carissa Parlato, Town of Ulysses; Judy Drake, Town of Ithaca and Board of Directors Chair; Ann Rider, Town of Enfield (arrived at 1:58 p.m.); Betty Conger, Village of Groton; Michael Murphy, Village of Dryden; Booke Jobin, Tompkins County

#### ***Municipal Representative via Proxy: 5***

Jennifer Case (Proxy – L. Shawley) Mack Cook, City of Cortland (Proxy – Judy Drake); Schelley Michell Nunn, City of Ithaca (Proxy – B. Jobin); Genevieve Suits (Proxy – Judy Drake); Ruth Hopkins, Town of Lansing (Proxy – Betty Conger)

#### ***Union Representatives: 7 members***

Scott Weatherby, TC3 Staff Unit; James Bower, IUOE Local 158, District 832 Bolton Point; Tim Farrell, City of Ithaca DPW Unit; Olivia Hersey, TC3 Professional Admin. Assoc. Unit; Doug Perine, Tompkins County White Collar President; Tim Arnold, Town of Dryden Teamsters; Jon Munson, Town of Ithaca Teamsters;

#### **Union Representatives via Proxy: 2**

Jerry Wright, Village of Cayuag Heights Police (Proxy – Scott Weatherby), Wilma VanDee, City of Cortland SEIU (Proxy – Derek Reynold (not in attendance)).

#### ***Others in attendance:***

Don Barber, Executive Director; Judy Taber, Locey & Cahill; Ashley Masucci, ProAct; Beth Miller, Excellus; Sharon Dovi, Tompkins Cortland Community College Human Resources

### **Call to Order**

Mr. Weatherby, Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:39 p.m.

### **Approval of Minutes of August 7, September 4, November 6 and December 4, 2014**

The minutes of August 7, September 4, November 6, and December 4, 2014 were deferred due to lack of quorum. MINUTES DEFERRED.

### **Report from the Chair of the Board of Directors**

Ms. Drake reported the Board met in December and appointed leadership for 2015 and also approved renewal of the Consortium's contract with Excellus for administration of medical

claims. She said the Municipal Cooperative Agreement is scheduled for a five-year review in 2015 and it has been sent to municipalities to review along with a request to submit any modifications they would like to made to see the document. The Board also approved a number of contract renewals including Stop Loss, Directors and Officers Liability Insurance and Errors and Omissions insurance.

### **Executive Director Report**

Mr. Barber reported the Consortium Board welcomed the Village of Homer into the Consortium effective January 1, 2015 and they will have a seat on this Committee. Also, the Town of Willet in Cortland County has informed the Consortium they would like to join in May. Mr. Barber said at that time the Consortium will have 17 municipal members which will trigger another labor representative on the Board of Directors. He noted that the Platinum Plan is the primary reason why both of these municipalities were able to join as they both have a similar Platinum Plan under the Affordable Care Act. They found the Consortium's Plan to be very competitive with the private sector and they like the notion of having some control over the process and the opportunity to retain value from reserves that can be gathered.

Mr. Barber provided an update on the status of the Recertification process and said three municipalities have completed their work and three others are nearly complete. The Town of Danby and Tompkins County are negotiating impacts of the Recertification process with some of their labor groups at this time.

He said he has been working on the Orientation Manual and the first draft was presented to the Executive Committee yesterday and he plans to finish it and present a final copy to the Board at the January 22<sup>nd</sup> meeting. He will be presenting the Manual to interested municipalities and bargaining units and will use that as a resource when talking about how the Consortium is set up and structured.

### **Discussion of the Role of the Joint Committee within the Consortium**

Mrs. Shawley said there was a suggestion made at the last meeting that people consider what their expectations were when they became a member of this Committee and whether they have been met and to also have a discussion about what things members would like to see different.

Mr. Weatherby said his expectations have evolved since he first became a member. He recalled the Platinum Plan proposal that was not approved by the Committee and said the Board made minor changes and adopted the Plan anyway. He agreed that this is a venue for labor to have a discussion but questioned what the point is of having this Committee when the Board passes something that wasn't approved by the Committee.

Mr. Murphy said this is a working Committee and there is a benefit to it existing. He said labor or management may not always get what it wants and although the Board will make the final decision there is at least a forum for people to talk about issues and to express opinions. He said Board meetings are so full of agenda items there is not usually enough time to have a lengthy discussion on any issue.

Mr. Farrell said he doesn't feel the Committee is balanced if municipalities are allowed to be members without labor representation. Mr. Barber clarified that each bargaining unit has a representative; therefore, there are more labor representatives that have a voting seat on this Committee. For example, the County would have one municipal seat but each bargaining unit is

entitled to a seat. One of the issues that was discussed at a previous meeting is that there are some municipalities that have employee groups that are not represented by a bargaining unit and they do not have a seat on this Committee. If there is a desire to have to change that this Committee could make a recommendation.

Mr. Weatherby said another issue is that some labor representatives are not permitted to attend meetings during the work day. It was agreed that this is a concern and suggested that the Board encourage municipalities encourage and support attendance by its labor representatives. A question was asked about how well the proxy form is being utilized. For this meeting there were two proxy forms submitted for labor and five for management.

Ms. Rider arrived at 1:58 p.m.

Mr. Bower said if there are people from labor who are routinely not attending or not submitting a proxy form it might be necessary to speak with their members to inform them they are not being represented. He believes the Committee is important and labor is fortunate to have a voice. He said there are 28 labor members on the Committee and 16 municipal members; therefore, labor already has the majority membership. He said efforts need to be made to communicate with both labor and management on the importance of their involvement and attendance at meetings. Mr. Bower said given today's technology and access to e-mail there is very little reason for someone to not be able to submit a proxy form.

Ms. Rider said the Consortium has done a great job and said often when things are going well it is common that people don't get involved. Ms. Mangione said she questioned why the Village of Cayuga Heights Police wasn't represented at the meetings and was told it can sometimes create coverage issues and would require the Village of pay for an officer to cover for one who is attending the meeting. She believes it is an issue for the Village Board of Trustees to decide whether to provide funding for another officer to cover so the member can attend. She feels it is important to have that officer here representing the Village Police and will be discussing this with the Mayor and the Chief of Police.

Mr. Weatherby said he would like to verify that contact information for Committee members is complete and accurate.

Ms. Hersey said some groups don't understand the value of participation on the Committee so she believes there is a disconnect and this needs to be addressed as well.

Mrs. Shawley said this Committee has existed for four years and in that time the issue on the Platinum Plan was the first major split in the Committee. She spoke of the progress the Committee has made and said its purpose is to get many different perspectives and that is very important.

Mr. Weatherby will explore options for alternative meeting dates and will work with Mr. Bower in reaching out to labor representatives. Mr. Barber also offered to assist with this.

Ms. Masucci said when she first came to the Consortium as a vendor she was told the purpose of the Committee was educate, enrich, and make sure everyone understands all of the different moving parts of the Consortium. She said of all of the Consortium's committees this is the only one that is in a position to have an open dialogue about what things are and what they mean to the Consortium's members.

### **Review of Bronze Benefit Plan**

Ms. Taber distributed an Excellus benefit summary on the Bronze metal level plan and stated it is the lowest level plan offered through the Affordable Care Act. She also distributed a document containing answers to questions that have been asked. She first explained that all plans have an actuarial value. Covered levels are: Bronze – 60%, Silver - 70%. Gold – 80%, and Platinum – 90%. These levels take into account the amount of money that is spent on ten essential benefits: ambulatory patient services, emergency services, hospitalization, maternity and newborn care, mental health and substance use disorder services including behavioral health treatment, prescription drugs, rehabilitative and habilitative services and devices, laboratory services, preventative and wellness and chronic disease management, and pediatric service including oral and vision care. Non-essential benefits are not included in the definition of essential benefits in the actuarial value calculation.

The Health and Human Services Department is charged with developing guidelines and the actuarial value has to be within 2% of the middle allowable percent. States have the option to use a national standard population or to develop their own standard population based on state claims data. States would also have the option to modify the national standard population using demographic and other adjustors in accordance with sound actuarial practices. Health Savings Account contributions are included in the actuarial value determinations; however, HSA contributions paid directly by the individual would not count towards the actuarial value.

Ms. Mangione asked if the model has any variation based on location because there are different costs in different areas for services. Ms. Miller said there are variances and different geographical sections within the State; when a person purchases a plan on the Exchange they are required to enter their zip code and it will narrow the selection to their geographic offering on the Exchange. Ms. Miller said it is very complicated and there are many calculations involved but they are basically looking at the population that will be serviced, the benefits being offered, reimbursement to providers, and what the risk possibilities are.

Ms. Taber provided a sample document to demonstrate how an actuarial value calculation is performed and walked the Committee through an exercise of making benefit changes to a plan to show how the actuarial value changes when a plan is altered. She noted that for the Bronze level plan the actuarial value must stay within the variable of 58-62%.

Mr. Barber said the purpose of the exercise is to show what variables can be manipulated and what effect it has on the cost of the plan. He said the Committee needs to think about what areas can be adjusted and discuss whether there should be co-pays increased or deductibles decreased. He said the mandatory benefits cannot be altered but pricing with member participation and cost sharing can be adjusted and it is important to understand and continue the discussion.

### **New Business**

There was no new business.

### **Old Business**

There was no old business.

Joint Committee on Plan Structure and Design  
January 8, 2015

**Next Meeting Agenda**

The following items were suggested for inclusion on the next agenda: Continue discussion of Bronze Plan development, Election of Chair and Vice Chair including alternates to the Board of Directors, and utilization data from ProAct and Excellus.

**Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 3:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by Michelle Pottorff, Administrative Clerk